



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/068,244	02/05/2002	Laurent Kieken	122191.101C1	8497

7590 10/03/2003  
PEPPER HAMILTON LLP  
50th Floor  
One Mellon Center  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219

EXAMINER	
DESTA, ELIAS	
ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
2857	

DATE MAILED: 10/03/2003

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

# Office Action Summary

Application No.

10/068,244

Applicant(s)

KIEKEN ET AL.

Examiner

Elias Desta

Art Unit

2857

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

## Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).
- Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

## Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 04 August 2003.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

## Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 13-28 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 13 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☒ Claim(s) 14-28 is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

## Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☒ The drawing(s) filed on 23 August 2003 is/are: a) ☒ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
- Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
- 11) ☐ The proposed drawing correction filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is: a) ☐ approved b) ☐ disapproved by the Examiner.
- If approved, corrected drawings are required in reply to this Office action.
- 12) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.

## Priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 119 and 120

- 13) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).
- \* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.
- 14) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application).
- a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.
- 15) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121.

## Attachment(s)

- 1) ☒ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☒ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449) Paper No(s) 2.
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413) Paper No(s) \_\_\_\_\_.
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- 6) ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_.

## Detailed Action

### Specification

1. The specification is objected to because of the following minor informalities:

- Page 10: in the substitute amendment "a17", delete "because" and then insert "hence" between "... materials" and "experimental kinetic data ..."; and
- Page 44: two tables are cited with one reference label; therefore, separate labeling is required. Suggestion: Table 7a and 7b respectively.

### Claim rejection – 35 U.S.C. 102

2. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(e) The invention was described in a patent granted on an application for patent by another filed in the United States before the invention thereof by the applicant for patent, or on an international application by another who has fulfilled the requirements of paragraphs (1), (2), and (4) of section 371(c) of this title before the invention thereof by the applicant for patent.

The changes made to 35 U.S.C. 102(e) by the American Inventors Protection Act

of 1999 (AIPA) and the Intellectual Property and High Technology Technical Amendments Act of 2002 do not apply when the reference is a U.S. patent resulting directly or indirectly from an international application filed before November 29, 2000. Therefore, the prior art date of the reference is determined under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) prior to the amendment by the AIPA (pre-AIPA 35 U.S.C. 102(e)).

3. Claims 13 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as anticipated by Wang et al. (U.S. Patent 6,489,168).

In reference to claim 13: Wang et al. teaches a process for the development of scaleable, high performance material (see Wang et al., column 1, lines 30-55). The process includes computer assisted knowledge cycle (predictive analysis) that uses experimental data (see Wang et al., column 13, lines 29-53, and columns 14-22).

#### Allowable Subject Matter

4. Claims 14-28 are objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

### Conclusion

5. The prior art made of record and not relied upon is considered pertinent to applicant disclosure.

- Turner et al. (U.S. 6,306,658) discloses an apparatus and method for carrying out and monitoring the progress and properties of multiple reactions, which is useful for synthesizing, screening, and characterization of combinatorial libraries.
- McFarland. (U.S. Patent 6,373,570) discloses a method and apparatus for screening diverse arrays of materials, such as techniques rapidly characterization of compounds in arrays of materials in order to optimize/discover new materials.
- Weinberg et al. (U.S. PAP 2002/0098471) discloses a method of synthesis, screening and characterization of organic metallic compounds and catalysts.
- Hinsberg, III et al. (U.S. Patent 5,625,579) teaches a system and method for simulating a mechanistic kinetic process over a predetermined time period to establish equilibrium conditions.
- Baig (U.S.PAP 2003/0077653) teaches a method for identifying active site inhibitors of a target protease.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Elias Desta whose telephone number is (703)-305-3840. The examiner can normally be reached on M-Thu (8:00-6:30).

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Marc S. Hoff can be reached on (703)-308-1677. The fax phone numbers for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned are (703)-308-5841 for regular communications and (703)-308-5841 for After Final communications.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is (703)-308-1782.

Elias Desta  
Examiner  
Art Unit 2857

-ed

September 9, 2003

  
MARC S. HOFF  
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER  
TECHNOLOGY CENTER 2800